

The Atlas of Reality

UNCORRECTED PROOFS

UNCORRECTED PROOFS

The Atlas of Reality

Comprehensive
A ~~Complete~~ Guide to Metaphysics

Robert C. Koons and Timothy H. Pickavance

UNCORRECTED PROOFS

WILEY Blackwell

This edition first published 2016
© 2016 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

Registered office

John Wiley & Sons, Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

Editorial Offices

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK
The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell.

The right of Robert C. Koons and Timothy H. Pickavance to be identified as the authors of this work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book.

Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty: While the publisher and authors have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Hardback ISBN: 9781119116127
Paperback ISBN: 9781119116264

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Cover image: [Production Editor to insert]
Cover design by [Production Editor to insert]

Set in 10/12.5pt MinionPro by Aptara Inc., New Delhi, India

To our children, Emily, Betsy and Ben Koons, and Lyle
and Gretchen Pickavance.

5

UNCORRECTED PROOFS

UNCORRECTED PROOFS

Contents

Acknowledgements	xvii
Part I Foundations	
1 Introduction	3
1.1 A Brief History of Metaphysics	3
1.2 Why Do Metaphysics?	5
1.2.1 Fatalism and alternative possibilities	6
1.2.2 Causation: rights, responsibilities, and knowledge	6
1.2.3 The foundations of science: laws, space, and time	7
1.2.4 Mind and body	7
1.2.5 Personal identity and persistence	8
1.3 How to Use the Book	9
2 Truthmakers	13
2.1 Introduction	13
2.1.1 Propositions	14
2.1.2 Truthmakers	17
2.2 Five Arguments for Classical Truthmaker Theory	19
2.3 The Challenge of Deflationism	25
2.4 Truthmaker Maximalism	30
2.4.1 Fundamentality and logically complex propositions	30
2.4.2 The problem of negative existentials	31
2.5 Alternatives to Truthmaker Maximalism	36
2.5.1 Atomic truthmaker theory	37
2.5.2 Spectral truthmaker theory	40
2.5.3 Truth supervenes on being	42
2.6 Conclusion and Preview	44
Notes	45
3 Grounding, Ontological Dependence, and Fundamentality	47
3.1 Is Grounding Real?	49

3.1.1	Connections with natural language	49
3.1.2	Plausible examples of grounding	49
3.1.3	Philosophical debates that turn on grounding claims	50
3.1.4	Fruitfulness of grounding	51
3.1.5	Grounding is different from conceptual priority, reduction, and supervenience	52
3.2	Relation between Grounding and Truthmaking	55
3.2.1	Interdefinability?	55
3.2.2	Can grounding theory replace truthmaking theory?	56
3.3	Relation between Grounding and Ontological Dependence	58
3.3.1	Two kinds of essence	58
3.3.2	Circular dependency?	58
3.3.3	Two kinds of fundamental entity	59
3.3.4	Grounding and essence	61
3.4	Conceptual vs. Extra-Conceptual Grounding	62
3.4.1	The ontological import of grounding	64
3.4.2	Support for the one truthmaker per fundamental property principle	65
3.5	Alternatives to Grounding?	65
3.5.1	Quine's method of paraphrase	66
3.5.2	Fine's <i>really</i> operator	67
3.5.3	Primitive fundamentality, naturalness, and primitive structure	68
3.6	Can Grounding Relations be Grounded?	69
3.7	Connections between Grounding and Entailment	71
3.8	How is Grounding Different from Causal Explanation?	72
3.9	Conclusion: Grounding and Ontological Economy	72
	Notes	73
Part II Dispositions		
4	Conditionals	77
4.1	Counterfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics	78
4.2	Hypotheticalism	84
4.3	Anti-Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature	86
4.4	Strong Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions	90
	Notes	92
5	Laws of Nature	94
5.1	Strong Nomism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws	94
5.2	Neo-Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers	99
5.2.1	Argument from scientific realism	100
5.2.2	The extrinsicality objection and small worlds	102
5.2.3	Objection based on induction	103
	Notes	105
6	Powers and Properties	106
6.1	Advantages of Strong Powerism	106
6.1.1	Causal connections and causal direction	106
6.1.2	Strong powerism and scientific knowledge	107
6.2	The Individuation of Properties	108

Contents

ix

6.2.1 The causal theory of properties: causal structuralism 111
 6.2.2 Dual-aspect vs. mixed two-category theories 117
 6.3 Objections to Strong Powerism 118
 6.4 Conclusion 121
 Notes 121

Part III Universals and Particulars

7 Universals 125
 7.1 Introduction 125
 7.1.1 What properties must explain 126
 7.2 Realism 128
 7.2.1 Troubles for realism 129
 7.2.2 Bradley's regress 137
 7.2.3 The challenge of Ostrich Nominalism 139
 7.3 Universals and the Problem of Intentionality 142
 7.4 Properties as the Ground of Causal Powers 145
 Notes 145

8 Reductive Nominalism and Trope Theory 147
 8.1 Reductive Nominalism 147
 8.1.1 Predicate Nominalism 148
 8.1.2 Class Nominalism 149
 8.1.3 Resemblance Nominalism 152
 8.2 Trope Theory 165
 8.2.1 Two varieties of Trope Theory 167
 8.2.2 Some troubles for Trope Theory 167
 8.3 Conclusion 169
 Notes 169

9 Particulars and the Problem of Individuation 171
 9.1 Introduction 171
 9.2 Facts 172
 9.3 Substances 175
 9.3.1 Relational Ontology 176
 9.3.2 Constituent Ontology 179
 Notes 200

10 Relations, Structures, and Quantities 201
 10.1 Accounts of Relational Facts 201
 10.2 Non-Symmetrical Relations and the Problem of Order 206
 10.2.1 The twin problems of converse relations 207
 10.2.2 Taking things in order 210
 10.2.3 A family of distinct, complex instantiation relations 210
 10.2.4 Constituent Ontologies and non-symmetric relations 211
 10.3 Structural Universals and Constituent Ontology 215
 10.4 Determinables, Quantities, and Real Numbers 219
 10.4.1 Determinate universal theory 220
 10.4.2 Simple intensity theory 221

7.2.2
v.

cap

C.P.

UNCORRECTED PROOFS

10.4.3 Composite intensity theory	224	
10.5 Conclusion and Preview	225	
Notes	225	
Part IV The Nature of Reality		
11 Nihilism and Monism	229	
11.1 Nihilism and Aliquidism	229	
11.2 Monism	237	
11.2.1 Parmenidean Monism	238	
11.2.2 Spinoza's Monism	240	
11.2.3 Bradley's Monism	243	
11.2.4 Jonathan Schaffer's Cosmic Monism	249	
Note	252	
12 The Non-Existent and the Vaguely Existing	253	
12.1 Does Everything Exist?	253	
12.1.1 Meinong's characterization principle and Russell's theory of descriptions	254	
12.1.2 Quantifiers and plural expressions	258	
12.1.3 Exportation and the Barcan formula	260	
12.1.4 Arguments for Actualism	262	
12.1.5 Arguments against Actualism	266	
12.1.6 Defining existence	270	
12.2 Ontic Vagueness	271	
12.2.1 The multiple meaning theory of vagueness.	274	
12.2.2 Real ontological vagueness	275	
12.2.3 Can identity or existence be vague?	279	
12.3 Conclusion	280	
13 Solipsism, Idealism, and the Problem of Perception	281	
13.1 Defining the Mental and the External	282	
13.2 Solipsism and Phenomenalism	284	
13.3 Theories of Perception	286	
13.3.1 The argument from hallucination and illusion	288	
13.3.2 The argument from colors	297	
13.4 Arguments against Phenomenalism	306	
13.4.1 What follows from the veil of perception?	306	
13.4.2 Common-sense and scientific realism	307	
13.4.3 The apparent impossibility of phenomenal reduction	308	
13.5 Arguments against Solipsism	309	
13.5.1 Appeals to common sense and to perception	309	
13.5.2 The paradigm case argument against ubiquitous illusion	310	
13.6 Conclusion and Preview	312	
Notes	313	
Part V Modality		
14 Possibility, Necessity, and Actuality: Concretism	317	

C.P.

C.P.

C.P.

C.P.

C.P.

C.P.

C.P.

Contents

xi

14.1	Introduction	317
14.2	Concretism: Worlds as Universes	321
14.3	Problems for Concretism	327
14.4	Conclusion	331
	Note	331
15	Abstractionism: Worlds as Representations	332
15.1	Magical Abstractionism	333
15.1.1	Modal Anti-Indexicalism	334
15.1.2	Non-indexical reductions of actuality	336
15.1.3	A dilemma for Magical Abstractionism	339
15.2	Structural Abstractionism	341
15.2.1	Linguistic Abstractionism	342
15.2.2	Pictorial Abstractionism	347
15.3	Aristotelian Theories of Possibility	348
15.4	Conclusion	350
	Note	351
16	De Re Modality and Modal Knowledge	352
16.1	Modality <i>De Re</i> : Transworld Identity and Counterpart Theory	352
16.1.1	From Abstractionism to Transworld Identity	354
16.1.2	From Concretism to counterpart theory	355
16.1.3	Strong transworld identity and mere haecceitistic differences	360
16.1.4	Summary	362
16.2	Modality and Epistemology: Possibility and Conceivability	363
16.2.1	Various notions of Conceivability	363
16.2.2	Objections to identifying the necessary and the a priori	364
16.2.3	Knowledge of possibility: patchwork principles	367
16.2.4	Aristotelian/powerist conceptions of modal knowledge	368
16.3	Conclusion	369
	Notes	369
Part VI Space and Time		
17	Is Space Merely Relational?	373
17.1	The Nature of Location	373
17.2	Spatial Substantivalism	375
17.2.1	Theory of spatial qualities: Advantages and disadvantages	378
17.2.2	Spatial particularism: Distance as an essential but external relation	378
17.3	Spatial Relationism	381
17.4	Absences and Vacuums	386
17.5	Conclusion	388
	Notes	389
18	Structure of Space: Points vs. Regions	390
18.1	Constructing Points from Regions	391
18.1.1	Digression on logical constructions	391
18.2	Points vs. Regions	394
18.3	Arguments against Points as Fundamental	397

C.p

C.p
C.p

18.3.1	Finitism	398
18.3.2	Mathematical paradoxes, from Zeno to Tarski	402
18.3.3	Spatial boundaries and physical contact	405
18.4	Voluminism vs. Volume-Boundary Dualism	408
18.4.1	Continuous variation in quantity and quality	410
18.4.2	Coincident boundaries: Actual vs. potential boundaries	413
18.5	Conclusion	414
	Note	414
19	The Structure of Time	415
19.1	Is Time Composed of Instants or Intervals?	415
19.1.1	Argument for instantism: Possible super-tasks	417
19.1.2	Arguments for intervalism: Impossible super-tasks	419
19.2	Instants as Dependent Entities	425
19.3	Does Time have a Beginning?	427
19.4	Conclusion	429
20	Time's Passage	430
20.1	Tensors and Anti-Tensors	432
20.2	Varieties of Anti-Tensism	435
20.2.1	Reflexive thoughts and old anti-tensism	435
20.2.2	Indexical propositions and New Anti-Tensism	436
20.3	Varieties of Tensism	437
20.4	Presentism	439
20.5	Arguments for Tensism	442
20.5.1	The "Thank Goodness" Problem	442
20.5.2	Evidence against indexicality: Parallels between 'now' and 'actually'	447
20.5.3	The experience of the flow of time	448
20.5.4	The present as a uniquely actual boundary between past and future	451
20.5.5	The threat of fatalism	453
20.5.6	Circular time and time travel	454
20.6	Conclusion	456
	Note	457
21	Arguments for Anti-Tensism	458
21.1	How Fast Does Time Flow?	458
21.2	Truthmakers for Truths about the Past	461
21.2.1	Reductionistic presentism or Occurentism	461
21.2.2	<i>Sui generis</i> properties of present-day objects	461
21.2.3	Primitive past-tensed facts or states of affairs.	462
21.2.4	Rejection of Truthmaker Theory	463
21.2.5	Truthmaker problems for Growing Block Tensism	463
21.2.6	Further truthmaker problems: Cross-temporal spatial relations (Motion)	464
21.2.7	Truthmaker problems: Other cross-temporal relations between past entities	466
21.2.8	A final truthmaker problem for presentism: Open-ended generalizations	469
21.3	The Theory of Relativity	469

C.P.
C.P.

C.P.

C.P.

Contents

xiii

21.4	Epistemological Problems for Tensism	473
21.4.1	Does anybody really know what time it is?	473
21.4.2	Everything we see is unreal	474
21.4.3	The problem of induction	474
21.5	McTaggart's Paradox	474
21.6	Brute Necessities of Time	476
21.7	Conclusion	478
Part VII Unity		
22	Material Composition: The Special Question	481
22.1	The Existence of Composite Things	482
22.2	Are Composite Things an "Ontological Free Lunch"?	482
22.3	Redundancy	485
22.4	Fundamental Heaps	490
22.4.1	Arguments against fundamental heaps	490
22.4.2	An argument in favor of fundamental heaps: The possibility of gunk	494
22.5	Fundamental Artifacts	497
22.5.1	Arguments against fundamental artifacts	498
22.6	Living Organisms vs. Mereological Nihilism	499
22.6.1	Arguments for fundamental living organisms	499
22.6.2	Argument against fundamental living organisms: physicalism and emergent powers	502
22.6.3	Mock physicalism and the absorption of powers	503
22.7	Finding an Intelligible Principle of Composition	504
22.7.1	Is there a principle of composition?	504
22.7.2	Do heaps exist?	506
22.7.3	Do artifacts exist?	512
	Notes	513
23	Composition: The General Question	514
23.1	Formal Mereology: Leśniewski, Goodman, and Leonard	514
23.2	Three (or Four) Answers to the General Composition Question	518
23.3	Accounting for the Correct Principles of Mereology	523
23.4	Parthood and Truthmaking	529
	Notes	530
24	Change and Persistence	531
24.1	Does Anything Change? Does Anything Persist?	532
24.2	How Objects Change Properties: Substratism vs. Replacementism	537
24.2.1	Replacementism: reducing the persistent to the instantaneous	542
24.2.2	Substratism vs. classical genidentity theory	546
24.3	The Metaphysics of Motion	551
24.3.1	The At/At Theory vs. Intrinsic Motion	551
24.3.2	The At/At Theory vs. Intervalism	553
	Notes	554
25	The Persistence of Composite Things	555
25.1	Mereological Constancy and Inconstancy	556

25.1.1	Objections to inconstant things: Paradoxes of intransitive persistence	557
25.1.2	Objections to inconstant things: Vagueness and conventionality	559
25.1.3	Responses to the objections	560
25.2	Coincident Things	564
25.2.1	Composite things and their matter	565
25.2.2	The grounding objection to coincidence	566
25.2.3	Avoiding coincident entities: Nihilism and <u>near-Nihilism</u>	568
25.2.4	Avoiding coincidence through dominant sortals	568
25.2.5	An Aristotelian solution to apparent coincidence	569
25.2.6	Replacementist solutions: temporal counterparts	570
25.3	Conclusion	573
	Note	574
Part VIII Causation		
26	The Existence and Scope of Causation	577
26.1	Are there Causes?	577
26.1.1	Arguments against Causal Realism	578
26.1.2	Arguments for Causal Realism	579
26.2	The Scope of Causation	583
26.2.1	Arguments against Universal Causation	583
26.2.2	Uncaused causes	585
	Note	589
27	Causation: A Relation between Things or Truths?	591
27.1	Causal Explanationism	592
27.1.1	Objections to Causal Explanationism	595
27.2	Causal Connectionism	605
27.2.1	Truthmakers and the relata of the causal connection	605
27.2.2	Objection to Causal Connectionism: Negative causation	607
	Notes	611
28	Discrete and Continuous Causation	613
28.1	Is All Causation Discrete?	614
28.2	The Nature of Discrete Causation	614
28.3	Is All Causation Continuous?	616
28.4	The Nature of Continuous Processes	618
28.4.1	Reductive accounts of processes	618
28.4.2	A non-reductive account	621
28.5	Processes and the Direction of Continuous Causation	621
28.6	Are Processes an Exception to Hume's Epistemic Principle?	622
28.7	Conclusion: The Consequences of Causation	623
	Notes	623
29	Conclusion: The Four Packages	624
	Appendix A	633

(C-r)

UNPUBLISHED PROOFS

Contents

xv

Appendix B

651

References

655

Index

000

UNCORRECTED PROOFS

UNCORRECTED PROOFS

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank our commissioning editor at Wiley-Blackwell, Deirdre Ilkson, our project editors, Roshna Mohan and Manish Luthra, and four anonymous reviewers. We would also like to thank Al Martinich, who got us started on this project by inviting us to contribute to the Fundamentals of Philosophy series. Our special thanks to Benjamin Koons for his help in proofreading the manuscript. We are grateful to Peter Forrest, L. A. Paul, Daniel Korman, Josh Parson, Graham Priest, and Trenton Merricks for comments on an early draft, Alexander Pruss and Josh Rasmussen for their help on causation and composition, and Robert Garcia for his insights on tropes and constituent ontology.

We have both benefited greatly from the assistance of our students, including the students of eight sections of PHL 323K and 327 at the University of Texas from 2010 through 2015. Graduate students at both the University of Texas and Biola University have contributed much to this project, including Bryan Pickel, Nicholas Mantegani, Brian Cutter, Nora Berenstain, Richard Lawton Davis, Nicole Garcia, Trevor Nyman, Kate Ritchie, Travis Hobbs, Briggs Wright, Janice Chik, Matthew M. O'Brien, and Max Goss.

RCK adds: I would like to acknowledge the support during the 2014-2015 academic year of the James Madison Program in American Ideals and Institutions at Princeton University (for a Visiting Fellowship) and the University of Texas at Austin (for a faculty research grant).

THP adds: I would like to thank Scott Rae and Clint Arnold, as well as the administration at Biola University, for a Sabbatical during the Fall of 2015.

UNCORRECTED PROOFS