The Atlas of Reality
The Atlas of Reality
Comprehensive
A Complete Guide to Metaphysics

Robert C. Koons and Timothy H. Pickavance

WILEY Blackwell
To our children, Emily, Betsy and Ben Koons, and Lyle and Gretchen Pickavance.
Contents

Acknowledgements xvii

Part I Foundations

1 Introduction 3
   1.1 A Brief History of Metaphysics 3
   1.2 Why Do Metaphysics? 5
      1.2.1 Fatalism and alternative possibilities 6
      1.2.2 Causation: rights, responsibilities, and knowledge 6
      1.2.3 The foundations of science: laws, space, and time 7
      1.2.4 Mind and body 7
      1.2.5 Personal identity and persistence 8
   1.3 How to Use the Book 9

2 Truthmakers 13
   2.1 Introduction 13
      2.1.1 Propositions 14
      2.1.2 Truthmakers 17
   2.2 Five Arguments for Classical Truthmaker Theory 19
   2.3 The Challenge of Deflationism 25
   2.4 Truthmaker Maximalism 30
      2.4.1 Fundamentality and logically complex propositions 30
      2.4.2 The problem of negative existentials 31
   2.5 Alternatives to Truthmaker Maximalism 36
      2.5.1 Atomic truthmaker theory 37
      2.5.2 Spectral truthmaker theory 40
      2.5.3 Truth supervenes on being 42
   2.6 Conclusion and Preview 44
   Notes 45

3 Grounding, Ontological Dependence, and Fundamentality 47
   3.1 Is Grounding Real? 49
3.1.1 Connections with natural language 49
3.1.2 Plausible examples of grounding 49
3.1.3 Philosophical debates that turn on grounding claims 50
3.1.4 Fruitfulness of grounding 51
3.1.5 Grounding is different from conceptual priority, reduction, and supervenience 52

3.2 Relation between Grounding and Truthmaking 55
3.2.1 Interdefinability? 55
3.2.2 Can grounding theory replace truthmaking theory? 56

3.3 Relation between Grounding and Ontological Dependence 58
3.3.1 Two kinds of essence 58
3.3.2 Circular dependency? 58
3.3.3 Two kinds of fundamental entity 59
3.3.4 Grounding and essence 61

3.4 Conceptual vs. Extra-Conceptual Grounding 62
3.4.1 The ontological import of grounding 64
3.4.2 Support for the one truthmaker per fundamental property principle 65

3.5 Alternatives to Grounding? 65
3.5.1 Quine’s method of paraphrase 66
3.5.2 Fine’s really operator 67
3.5.3 Primitive fundamentality, naturalness, and primitive structure 68

3.6 Can Grounding Relations be Grounded? 69
3.7 Connections between Grounding and Entailment 71
3.8 How is Grounding Different from Causal Explanation? 72
3.9 Conclusion: Grounding and Ontological Economy 72

Notes 73

Part II Dispositions

4 Conditionals 77
4.1 Counterfactual Conditionals: Semantics, Logic, and Metaphysics 78
4.2 Hypotheticalism 84
4.3 Anti-Hypotheticalism and Laws of Nature 86
4.4 Strong Hypotheticalism: Counterfactual Accounts of Powers and Dispositions 90
Notes 92

5 Laws of Nature 94
5.1 Strong Nomism: The Dretske-Armstrong-Tooley (DAT) Theory of Laws 94
5.2 Neo-Humeism: Reduction of Conditionals, Laws, and Powers 99
5.2.1 Argument from scientific realism 100
5.2.2 The extrinsicality objection and small worlds 102
5.2.3 Objection based on induction 103
Notes 105

6 Powers and Properties 106
6.1 Advantages of Strong Powerism 106
6.1.1 Causal connections and causal direction 106
6.1.2 Strong powerism and scientific knowledge 107
6.2 The Individualization of Properties 108
Contents

6.2.1 The causal theory of properties: causal structuralism 111
6.2.2 Dual-aspect vs. mixed two-category theories 117
6.3 Objections to Strong Powerism 118
6.4 Conclusion 121
Notes 121

Part III Universals and Particulars 125

7 Universals 125
7.1 Introduction 126
7.1.1 What properties must explain 126
7.2 Realism 128
7.2.1 Troubles for realism 129
7.2.2 Bradley’s regress 137
7.2.3 The challenge of Ostrich Nominalism 139
7.3 Universals and the Problem of Intentionality 142
7.4 Properties as the Ground of Causal Powers 145
Notes 145

8 Reductive Nominalism and Trope Theory 147
8.1 Reductive Nominalism 147
8.1.1 Predicate Nominalism 148
8.1.2 Class Nominalism 149
8.1.3 Resemblance Nominalism 152
8.2 Trope Theory 165
8.2.1 Two varieties of Trope Theory 167
8.2.2 Some troubles for Trope Theory 167
8.3 Conclusion 169
Notes 169

9 Particulars and the Problem of Individuation 171
9.1 Introduction 171
9.2 Facts 172
9.3 Substances 175
9.3.1 Relational Ontology 176
9.3.2 Constituent Ontology 179
Notes 200

10 Relations, Structures, and Quantities 201
10.1 Accounts of Relational Facts 201
10.2 Non-Symmetrical Relations and the Problem of Order 206
10.2.1 The twin problems of converse relations 207
10.2.2 Taking things in order 210
10.2.3 A family of distinct, complex instantiation relations 210
10.2.4 Constituent Ontologies and non-symmetric relations 211
10.3 Structural Universals and Constituent Ontology 215
10.4 Determinables, Quantities, and Real Numbers 219
10.4.1 Determinate universal theory 220
10.4.2 Simple intensity theory 221
Contents

10.4.3 Composite intensity theory 224
10.5 Conclusion and Preview 225

Notes 225

Part IV The Nature of Reality

11 Nihilism and Monism 229
11.1 Nihilism and Alickidism 229
11.2 Monism 237
  11.2.1 Parmenidean Monism 238
  11.2.2 Spinozal Monism 240
  11.2.3 Bradley’s Monism 243
  11.2.4 Jonathan Schaffer’s Cosmic Monism 249
Note 252

12 The Non-Existent and the Vaguely Existing 253
12.1 Does Everything Exist? 253
  12.1.1 Meinong’s characterization principle and Russell’s theory of
descriptions 254
  12.1.2 Quantifiers and plural expressions 258
  12.1.3 Exportation and the Barcan formula 260
  12.1.4 Arguments for Actualism 262
  12.1.5 Arguments against Actualism 266
  12.1.6 Defining existence 270
12.2 Ontic Vagueness 271
  12.2.1 The multiple meaning theory of vagueness. 274
  12.2.2 Real ontological vagueness 275
  12.2.3 Can identity or existence be vague? 279
12.3 Conclusion 280

13 Solipsism, Idealism, and the Problem of Perception 281
13.1 Defining the Mental and the External 282
13.2 Solipsism and Phenomenalism 284
13.3 Theories of Perception 286
  13.3.1 The argument from hallucination and illusion 288
  13.3.2 The argument from colors 297
13.4 Arguments against Phenomenalism 306
  13.4.1 What follows from the veil of perception? 306
  13.4.2 Common-sense and scientific realism 307
  13.4.3 The apparent impossibility of phenomenal reduction 308
13.5 Arguments against Solipsism 309
  13.5.1 Appeals to common sense and to perception 309
  13.5.2 The paradigm case argument against ubiquitous illusion 310
13.6 Conclusion and Preview 312

Notes 313

Part V Modality

14 Possibility, Necessity, and Actuality: Concretism 317
Contents

14.1 Introduction 317
14.2 Concretism: Worlds as Universes 321
14.3 Problems for Concretism 327
14.4 Conclusion 331
Note 331

15 Abstractionism: Worlds as Representations 332
15.1 Magical Abstractionism 333
  15.1.1 Modal Anti-Indexicalism 334
  15.1.2 Non-indexical reductions of actuality 336
  15.1.3 A dilemma for Magical Abstractionism 339
15.2 Structural Abstractionism 341
  15.2.1 Linguistic Abstractionism 342
  15.2.2 Pictorial Abstractionism 347
15.3 Aristotelian Theories of Possibility 348
15.4 Conclusion 350
Note 351

16 De Re Modality and Modal Knowledge 352
16.1 Modality De Re: Transworld Identity and Counterpart Theory 352
  16.1.1 From Abstractionism to Transworld Identity 354
  16.1.2 From Concretism to counterpart theory 355
  16.1.3 Strong transworld identity and mere haecceitistic differences 360
  16.1.4 Summary 362
16.2 Modality and Epistemology: Possibility and Conceivability 363
  16.2.1 Various notions of Conceivability 363
  16.2.2 Objections to identifying the necessary and the a priori 364
  16.2.3 Knowledge of possibility: patchwork principles 367
  16.2.4 Aristotelian/powerist conceptions of modal knowledge 368
16.3 Conclusion 369
Notes 369

Part VI Space and Time

17 Is Space Merely Relational? 373
17.1 The Nature of Location 373
17.2 Spatial Substantialism 375
  17.2.1 Theory of spatial qualities: Advantages and disadvantages 378
  17.2.2 Spatial particularism: Distance as an essential but external relation 378
17.3 Spatial Relationism 381
17.4 Absences and Vacuums 386
17.5 Conclusion 388
Notes 389

18 Structure of Space: Points vs. Regions 390
18.1 Constructing Points from Regions 391
  18.1.1 Digression on logical constructions 391
  18.1.2 Points vs. Regions 394
  18.3 Arguments against Points as Fundamental 397
18.3.1 Finitism 398
18.3.2 Mathematical paradoxes, from Zeno to Tarski 402
18.3.3 Spatial boundaries and physical contact 405
18.4 Voluminism vs. Volume-Boundary Dualism 408
18.4.1 Continuous variation in quantity and quality 410
18.4.2 Coincident boundaries: Actual vs. potential boundaries 413
18.5 Conclusion 414
Note 414

19 The Structure of Time 415
19.1 Is Time Composed of Instants or Intervals? 415
19.1.1 Argument for Instantism: Possible super-tasks 417
19.1.2 Arguments for Intervalism: Impossible super-tasks 419
19.2 Instants as Dependent Entities 425
19.3 Does Time have a Beginning? 427
19.4 Conclusion 429

20 Time’s Passage 430
20.1 Tensers and Anti-Tensers 432
20.2 Varieties of Anti-Tensism 435
20.2.1 Reflexive thoughts and old anti-tensism 435
20.2.2 Indexical propositions and New Anti-Tensism 436
20.3 Varieties of Tensism 437
20.4 Presentism 439
20.5 Arguments for Tensism 442
20.5.1 The “Thank Goodness” Problem 442
20.5.2 Evidence against indexicality: Parallels between ‘now’ and ‘actually’ 447
20.5.3 The experience of the flow of time 448
20.5.4 The present as a uniquely actual boundary between past and future 451
20.5.5 The threat of fatalism 453
20.5.6 Circular time and time travel 454
20.6 Conclusion 456
Note 457

21 Arguments for Anti-Tensism 458
21.1 How Fast Does Time Flow? 458
21.2 Truthmakers for Truths about the Past 461
21.2.1 Reductionistic presentism or Occurrentism 461
21.2.2 Sui generis properties of present-day objects 461
21.2.3 Primitive past-tensed facts or states of affairs. 462
21.2.4 Rejection of Truthmaker Theory 463
21.2.5 Truthmaker problems for Growing Block Tensism 463
21.2.6 Further truthmaker problems: Cross-temporal spatial relations (Motion) 464
21.2.7 Truthmaker problems: Other cross-temporal relations between past entities 466
21.2.8 A final truthmaker problem for presentism: Open-ended generalizations 469
21.3 The Theory of Relativity 469
Contents

21.4 Epistemological Problems for Tensism
   21.4.1 Does anybody really know what time it is? 473
   21.4.2 Everything we see is unreal 474
   21.4.3 The problem of induction 474
21.5 McTaggart's Paradox 474
21.6 Brute Necessities of Time 476
21.7 Conclusion 478

Part VII Unity

22 Material Composition: The Special Question 481
   22.1 The Existence of Composite Things 482
   22.2 Are Composite Things an "Ontological Free Lunch"? 482
   22.3 Redundancy 485
   22.4 Fundamental Heaps 490
      22.4.1 Arguments against fundamental heaps 490
      22.4.2 An argument in favor of fundamental heaps: The possibility of gunk 494
   22.5 Fundamental Artifacts 497
      22.5.1 Arguments against fundamental artifacts 498
   22.6 Living Organisms vs. Mereological Nihilism 499
      22.6.1 Arguments for fundamental living organisms 499
      22.6.2 Argument against fundamental living organisms: physicalism and emergent powers 502
      22.6.3 Mock physicalism and the absorption of powers 503
   22.7 Finding an Intelligible Principle of Composition 504
      22.7.1 Is there a principle of composition? 504
      22.7.2 Do heaps exist? 506
      22.7.3 Do artifacts exist? 512
Notes 513

23 Composition: The General Question 514
   23.1 Formal Mereology: Leśniewski, Goodman, and Leonard 514
   23.2 Three (or Four) Answers to the General Composition Question 518
   23.3 Accounting for the Correct Principles of Mereology 523
   23.4 Parthood and Truthmaking 529
Notes 530

24 Change and Persistence 531
   24.1 Does Anything Change? Does Anything Persist? 532
   24.2 How Objects Change Properties: Substratist vs. Replacementism 537
      24.2.1 Replacementism: reducing the persistent to the instantaneous 542
      24.2.2 Substratism vs. classical gerenidentity theory 546
   24.3 The Metaphysics of Motion 551
      24.3.1 The At/At' Theory vs. Intrinsic Motion 551
      24.3.2 The At/At' Theory vs. Intervalism 553
Notes 554

25 The Persistence of Composite Things 555
   25.1 Mereological Constancy and Inconstancy 556
Contents

25.1 Objections to inconstant things: Paradoxes of intransitive persistence 557
25.1.1 Objections to inconstant things: Paradoxes of intransitive persistence 557
25.1.2 Objections to inconstant things: Vagueness and conventionality 559
25.1.3 Responses to the objections 560
25.2 Coincident Things 564
25.2.1 Composite things and their matter 565
25.2.2 The grounding objection to coincidence 566
25.2.3 Avoiding coincident entities: Nihilism and near-Nihilism 568
25.2.4 Avoiding coincidence through dominant sortals 568
25.2.5 An Aristotelian solution to apparent coincidence 569
25.2.6 Replacementist solutions: temporal counterparts 570
25.3 Conclusion 573
Note 574

Part VIII  Causation

26 The Existence and Scope of Causation 577
26.1 Are there Causes? 577
26.1.1 Arguments against Causal Realism 578
26.1.2 Arguments for Causal Realism 579
26.2 The Scope of Causation 583
26.2.1 Arguments against Universal Causation 583
26.2.2 Uncau sed causes 585
Note 589

27 Causation: A Relation between Things or Truths? 591
27.1 Causal Explanationism 592
27.1.1 Objections to Causal Explanationism 595
27.2 Causal Connectionism 605
27.2.1 Truthmakers and the relata of the causal connection 605
27.2.2 Objection to Causal Connectionism: Negative causation 607
Notes 611

28 Discrete and Continuous Causation 613
28.1 Is All Causation Discrete? 614
28.2 The Nature of Discrete Causation 614
28.3 Is All Causation Continuous? 616
28.4 The Nature of Continuous Processes 618
28.4.1 Reductive accounts of processes 618
28.4.2 A non-reductive account 621
28.5 Processes and the Direction of Continuous Causation 621
28.6 Are Processes an Exception to Hume's Epistemic Principle? 622
28.7 Conclusion: The Consequences of Causation 623
Notes 623

29 Conclusion: The Four Packages 624

Appendix A 633
Contents

Appendix B 651

References 655

Index 000
Acknowledgements

We would like to thank our commissioning editor at Wiley-Blackwell, Deirdre Ilkson, our project editors, Roshna Mohan and Manish Luthra, and four anonymous reviewers. We would also like to thank Al Martinich, who got us started on this project by inviting us to contribute to the Fundamentals of Philosophy series. Our special thanks to Benjamin Koons for his help in proofreading the manuscript. We are grateful to Peter Forrest, L. A. Paul, Daniel Korman, Josh Parson, Graham Priest, and Trenton Merricks for comments on an early draft, Alexander Pruss and Josh Rasmussen for their help on causation and composition, and Robert Garcia for his insights on tropes and constituent ontology.

We have both benefited greatly from the assistance of our students, including the students of eight sections of PHIL 323K and 327 at the University of Texas from 2010 through 2015. Graduate students at both the University of Texas and Biola University have contributed much to this project, including Bryan Pickel, Nicholas Mantegani, Brian Cutter, Nora Berenstain, Richard Lawton Davis, Nicole Garcia, Trevor Nyman, Kate Ritchie, Travis Hobbs, Briggs Wright, Janice Chikh, Matthew M. O'Brien, and Max Goss.

RCK adds: I would like to acknowledge the support during the 2014-2015 academic year of the James Madison Program in American Ideas and Institutions at Princeton University (for a Visiting Fellowship) and the University of Texas at Austin (for a faculty research grant).

THP adds: I would like to thank Scott Rae and Clint Arnold, as well as the administration at Biola University, for a Sabbatical during the Fall of 2015.